

季羨林教授
八十華誕紀念論文集

(下)

Papers
in Honour of
Prof. Dr. Ji Xianlin
on the Occasion
of His 80th Birthday (II)

Chief-Editor: Li Zheng
Jiang Zhongxin
Editor: Duan Qing
Qian Wenzhong

主編：李 錚
蔣忠新
編委：段 晴
錢文忠

江 西 人 民 出 版 社

1991

TEXTCRITICAL NOTES ON SANSKRIT TEXTS

I . Bodhi(sattva)caryavatāra.

CHR. LINDTNER
(Copenhagen)

Among the numerous Sanskrit texts (more than 1000 titles, comprising approximately 50000 palmyra leaves) that have recently been brought to light in and around Lhasa there are also a few tantalizing titles that are bound to create a stir of expectation among Buddhologists all around the globe. Speaking of Madhyamaka śāstras there are complete Sanskrit manuscripts of Nāgārjuna's *Ratnāvalī*, of *Dharmadhātustava* ascribed to that author, of Bhavya's *Madhyamakahr̥daya(kārikā)*, Candrakīrti's *Madhyamakāvātāra*, and of Abhayākaragupta's *Munimatālaṅkāra* and *Madhyamakamañjarī*. There are also manuscripts of texts already available in Sanskrit such as *Mūlamadhyamakakārikā*, *Vigrahavyāvartanī*, *Prasannapadā*, *Śikṣāsamuccaya*, *Bodhi(sattva)caryāvatāra*, etc. On the other hand, we in vain look for manuscripts containing the works of Āryadeva, Buddhapālita, Kamalaśīla (apart from *Bhāvanākrama I*) and Śāntarakṣita (apart from a fragment containing his commentary on the *Bodhisattvasaṃvaraviṃśaka*, and the complete commentary on the *Vādanyāya*).

Also other trends of Buddhist thought are represented. Here I shall have to confine myself to the most important: The commentary of Sthiramati on Vasubandhu's *Pañcaskandhaka* and that of Jinendrabuddhi on Dignāga's *Pramāṇasamuccaya* (286 leaves); there is also a fragment of his *Nyāyamukha*, but no trace of his other works. When it comes to Dharmakīrti, all his works are represented, including complete manuscripts of his *Pramāṇavinīśaya*, *Het-*

ubindu, *Sambandhaparikṣā* and *Samtānāntarasiddhi* (fragment). Fate has been kind to Vinitadeva; His commentaries are available on *Nyāyabindu*, *Hetubindu*, *Sambandhaparikṣā* and *Samtānāntarasiddhi*.

A large number of Mahāyānasūtras have also been discovered. Among the most interesting is the *Bodhisattvaṣṭaka*, a text very important for the early Mādhyamikas.

While most of these manuscripts are still in Tibet, a smaller portion (ca. 250 manuscripts) were brought to Beijing in 1960. Nearly all these manuscripts have already been described, copied or even edited (especially Jñānaśri and Ratnakirti) by the great Rāhulji back in the thirties. (Cf. Michael Torsten Much, *A Visit to Rāhula Sāṅkṛtyāyana's Collection of Negatives at the Bihar Research Society*, Wien 1988.) Unfortunately, many of Rāhulji's copies (and editions) are of a very poor quality, and some texts were not even copied by him at all. Hence the main value of the collection of Sanskrit manuscripts in Beijing consists in the fact that it enables us to fill out lacunae left by Rāhulji.

In this paper I intend, for a start, to report the variant readings found in one of these manuscripts. It is a complete copy (23 leaves) of Śāntideva's (or Śāntadeva's) celebrated *Bodhisattvacaryāvatāra*, generally known under the abbreviated title *Bodhicaryāvatāra*. The text has often been edited and translated. Unfortunately, in most cases the translators have got the title wrong. It is not "Entering the Path of Enlightenment", or some such thing, but rather "A Presentation of (An Introduction to) the Career of a Bodhisattva (i. e. an adherent of Mahāyāna)". For details about manuscripts, editions, etc. I may refer to Amalia Pezzali, *Śāntideva — mystique bouddhiste des VII^e et VIII^e siècles*, Firenze 1968.

Our manuscript, No. 124 in the Beijing collection, China Library of Nationalities, is complete and very accurate; the material is palmyra leaves, 23 leaves, six lines on each sides. Age: ca. 1000 years old; the script is the so-called *proto-Bengali-cum-Maithili*, as is also, for instance, the unique Sanskrit manuscript of Bhavya's *Madhyamakahr̥daya*. See Olle Qvarnström, *Hindu Philosophy in Buddhist Perspective. The Vedāntatattvaviniścaya — Chapter of Bhavya's Madhyamakahr̥dayakārikā*, Lund 1989.

In the list of variant readings that follow I refer to this manuscript as C. For

purpose of comparison with the printed text of *Bodhi(sattva)caṣvātāra*, I have, not without some hesitation, chosen to use the rather convenient edition of Vidhushekhara Bhattacharya, *Bodhicaryāvatāra*, Calcutta 1960. I refer to this text as B. The reader is, to be sure, reminded of the earlier editions by Minayeff, H. P. Sastri, La Vallée Poussin, and P. L. Vaidya.

I am very grateful to the authorities of the China Library of Nationalities (Zhongguo Minzu Tushuguan) for letting me use this and other materials for publication. A special debt of gratitude goes to Mrs. Hu Haiyan-von Hinüber without whose kind assistance all doors would probably have remained closed. In a few cases I was able to benefit from her long experience in the field of Sanskrit palaeography.

Let me end by expressing the hope that all these new and exciting materials will, without further delay, be catalogued and made readily available to the international world of interested scholars.

I . 6b balaṃ tu B: balaṃ nu C

I . 9c na B: sa C

I . 13b yad B: yady C

I . 16d yathāsaṃkhyena B: yāthāsaṃkhyena C

I . 25b kathaṃ B: kutaḥ C

I . 28b duḥkhaniḥsaraṇāśayā B: duḥkhaniḥsaraṇāśayā C

I . 29c pūrvasukhaiḥ B: sarvasukhaiḥ C

I . 32c -mātrādānataḥ B: -dānamātrataḥ C

I . 35c pāpakarma B: pāpakaṃ C (*read* na pāpakaṃ)

II . 8c -sattvāḥ B: -sattvā C

II . 12b unmr̥śāmi B: unmr̥jāmi C

II . 15a mandāra- B: mādāra C

II . 16a -manoramaiś B: -manoharaiś C

II . 16c bhaujyaiś ca svādyair B: bhojyaiḥ sakhādyair C

II . 21c -varṣāś ca B: -varṣāṇi C

II . 32 *om* . C *et ad.* kathaṃ ca *etc.* with nāyakāḥ (*for* nāyakaḥ) in C

- II . 34b pāpaṃkṛ tam B: kṛ taṃ pāpam C
 II . 35 = II . 36 *in* C
 II . 36 = II . 35 *in* C
 II . 38b na mayā B: mayā na C
 II . 38c mohā- B: tenā- C
 II . 40d -vedanā B: -vedanāḥ C
 II . 44c -grastaḥ B: -grasta C
 II . 46a śūnyā B: -śūnya C
 II . 49a samasta- B: samanta- C
 II . 54a -bhīto 'pi B: bhītyāpi C
 II . 64c -duḥkhabhītaḥ B: -bhītabhītaḥ C
 II . 65 *after this verse C adds pāpadeśana (for -deśanā)*
- III . 3b -sukhāvahān B: -sukhākarān C
 III . 3c -hitādhānān B: -hitādhārān C; C *adds* puṇyānumodanā
 III . 4 *after this verse C adds adhyeṣaṇā*
 III . 5b yācayāmi B: prārthayāmi C
 III . 5c anantāṃs B: analpāṃs C; C *adds* yācanā
 III . 15c teṣāṃ sa eva B: sa eva teṣāṃ C
 III . 23d yathākramam B: yathākamam(!) C
 III . 29c -śrānto B: -śrānta- C
- IV . 2c kuryānavety B: kuryān na vety ? C
 IV . 9d -dhātinaḥ B: -ghātinaḥ C
 IV . 15b vā B: ca C
 IV . 16c kṣaṇaṃ viśaṃvādi B: kṣaṇaviśaṃvādi C
 IV . 19c sugata- B: sugati- C
 IV . 23b paraḥ B: param C
 IV . 25d dhakṣyatiniścitam(!) B: dhakṣyatyaśikṣitam C
 IV . 26c nīto 'haṃ B: nīye 'haṃ C
 IV . 33c tv *om.* C
 IV . 34a itisatata- B: itisaṃtati- C

- N . 35d sukhaṃ B; śubhaṃ C
 N . 37a -kārān B; -cākān C
 N . 37b prasamaṃ B; prasabhaṃ C
 N . 37d upa- *om.* C
 N . 39c mahārha- B; mahārtha- C
 N . 40d sahe 'ham B; sahe 'yam C
 N . 41c mahātmāpi B; yadātmāpi C
 N . 45a tu B; hi C
 N . 46a manaḥstho B; manmasto (!) C
 N . 47c hṛdayatrāsaṃ B; hṛdaya trāsaṃ? C
 N . 48 C *has* bodhicittāpramādo nāma (*for* bodhisattvasikṣā) *after this verse*
- V . 3c kṛtsnaṃ B; sarvaṃ C
 V . 4c narakapālās B; narapālās C
 V . 8c kaiścitrailokye B; kaiścit trailokye C
 V . 12c krodha- B; kodha- C
 V . 14a tadvac B; tāvat (!) C
 V . 47d yuktimat B; yuktimān ? C
 V . 52b pariṣat- B; parṣat- C
 V . 53c vā B; ca C
 V . 70b -niścayāt B; -niśrayāt C
 V . 78a me *om.* C
 V . 80c etān eva B; yasmād etān C
 V . 85a -gatānātha- B; -gatān anāthān C
 V . 86b itarārthe B; itarārthaṃ C
 V . 104d mūlapattir B; mūlapattiṃ C
 V . 109 C *has* śilapāramitā (*for* samprajanyarakṣaṇaṃ *etc.*) *after this stanza*
- VI . 1d tat B; tataḥ C
 VI . 7c daurmanasyāsaṇaṃ B; daurmanasyāsaṇaṃ C
 VI . 7d dṛpto B; tṛpto ? C
 VI . 25c yat B; tat C

- VI. 31c nirmāṇavat B: nirvāṇavat C
 VI. 33d evaṃ B: etan C
 VI. 43a mama kāyās B: mamākāyās C
 VI. 66d vyathāmataḥ B: vyathāṃ manaḥ C
 VI. 72b kathaṃ B: karaṃ C
 VI. 73b pāryate B: śakyate C
 VI. 88b kiṃ B: na kiṃ C
 VI. 97a stuto 'smīti B: stuta iti C
 VI. 98a kṣobhaṃ B: kṣemaṃ C
 VI. 99b mama ye B: ye mama C
 VI. 105c na ca B: na hi C
 VI. 106c 'naparādhasya B: 'naparādhyasya C
 VI. 107d spṛhaṇīyo ripur mama B: spṛhiniyo mayā ripuḥ C
 VI. 109c acito 'pi B: acitto 'pi C
 VI. 111d pūjyaḥ B: pūjyate (*sec. man.* pūjya) C
 VI. 118b -rūpyeṇa B: -rupeṇa C
 VI. 120d evācaraṇiyameṣu B: evācarita?? meṣu C
 VI. 121b tad- B: yad- C
 VI. 129c tathā B: tasmān C
- VII. 1a kṣamo B: kṣamī ? C
 VII. 5b krameṇaiva B: krameṇaivaṃ C
 VII. 18c -vaśāt B: -balāt C
 VII. 22a idaṃ tu me B: etat (!) C
 VII. 28a kāyaḥ sukhitaḥ B: sukhitaḥ kāyaḥ C
 VII. 28d kṛpāluḥ B: dayāluḥ C
 VII. 30b sacetanaḥ B: sacetana C
 VII. 35c tatraikaika- B: yatraikaika- C
 VII. 50a kleśasva- B: kleśāsva- C
 VII. 56d -vaśās ca B: -vaśās tu C
 VII. 57d durdarśanāḥ B: durdaśanāḥ C
 VII. 59a śūrā B: virāḥ C

VII. 61a hi B; ca C; C adds a verse (= IV. 44) also available in Tib. and Mong. :

galantv antrāṇi me kāmaṃ śiraḥ patatu nāma me /
na tv evāvanatiṃ yāmi sarvathā kleśavairiṇām //

VII. 62d -phalasukhepsuvat B; -sukhaphalepsuvat C

VII. 65d prāptasarāḥ B; prāptasaraḥ C

VIII. 2a -vivekena B; -vitarkena C

VIII. 4a vipaśyanā- B; vipaśyanayā C

VIII. 12b hīnān mānaḥ stuter B; hīnāmānastuter C

VIII. 15d kiṃtū- B; kiṃ nū ? C

VIII. 18a tatra B; yatra C

VIII. 18d -tiṣṭhati B; -tiṣṭhate C

VIII. 19d pratikṣatām B; pratikṣyate K

VIII. 33b caika B; ka C

VIII. 35b sa om. C

VIII. 38d mayā sadā B; sadā mayā C

VIII. 42d -nirvṛtāḥ B; -nirvṛtiḥ C

VIII. 43a tāny B; tān C

VIII. 51 om. C

VIII. 54b draṣṭuṃ spraṣṭuṃ B; spraṣṭuṃ draṣṭuṃ

VIII. 55b ut in VIII. 54b, q. v.

VIII. 60a alpatvān B; avataṃ C

VIII. 65d rajyate B; rakṣyase C

VIII. 67d ut in VIII. 65d, q. v.

VIII. 77b jīvitam B; jīvitum C

VIII. 79d -vimukteḥ B; -vimuktyai C

VIII. 84c kāmānām B; kāmīnām C

VIII. 87c -muktaḥ B; -muktaś C

VIII. 92c tasya tadduḥkhaṃ B; tadduḥkham eva C

VIII. 99a yad duḥkhaṃ B; tat duḥkham C

VIII. 104c nirupyedaṃ B; nirūpyevaṃ C

- VII. 111a asāreṣv B ; abhyāsād C
 VII. 120a ca *om.* C
 VII. 122a mandya B; māndya- C
 VII. 135b śakyate B; pāryate C (*cf.* VI. 73b)
 VII. 147b yateta B; yata C
 VII. 149a chadyerann B; kādyerann C
 VII. 152d parimokṣye B; paribhokṣye C
 VII. 157c muktā B; muktvā C
 VII. 168d tad- B; tvad- C
 VII. 171a tvāṃ *poṣṭ* dāsyāmi C
 VII. 172c svārthaceṭaṃ tvāṃ B; tvāṃ svārthaceṭaṃ C
 VII. 185 C *adds a verse available in Tib. and Mong. :*
 muktvā smṛtikathāṃ soḍhāṃ kṛpāsajñāna (!) jinātmajān/
 svapne 'pi nekṣe anena (!) bhaveyaṃ duḥkhitāṃ tadā//
- IX. 11d pāpapuṇya- B; puṇyāpuṇya- C
 IX. 21 *om.* C
 IX. 22d jñātvedaṃ kena kathyate B; kena yad ucyate (!)
 IX. 28b tathā manaḥ B; manas tathā C
 IX. 41d yataḥ B; na ca C
 IX. 45b duḥkhitā B; duḥsthitā C
 IX. 53a saktitrāsātva B; śaktitrāsānta- C
 IX. 55b pratipakṣo B; pratipakṣaṃ C
 IX. 56b prajāyatam B; prajāyate C
 IX. 58c śiṃghānaṃ B; śiṃghānam C
 IX. 61a tadā B; sadā C
 IX. 66d apūrveyaṃ tadekatā B; anyā pūrveyam ekatā C
 IX. 70d matā B; kṛtā C
 IX. 78c cet B; ced C
 IX. 79c pṛ ṣ ṭhaṃ B; pṛ ṣ ṭho C
 IX. 81d ca B; tu C
 IX. 83d nu B; tu C

- IX . 90c āyāsaḥ B; āyāso C
 IX . 102d eva B; evaṃ C
 IX . 106c ca B; cet C
 IX . 117b udikṣate B; udikṣyate ? C
 IX . 122b cet B; cen C
 IX . 134b anitye B; anityaṃ C
 IX . 138c cet B; ca C
 IX . 143a nāpi B; vāpi C
 IX . 149d dvi- B; dviḥ C
 IX . 150a ca na virodho B; na ca nirodho C
 IX . 152a dharmeṣu B; bhāveṣu C
 IX . 165c manyanta B; manyante C
 IX . 168c -anupalambheva B; -anupalambhena C

- X . 1c sarvaṃ B; sarve C
 X . 3c -sukhaṃ prāptaṃ B; sukhaprāptaṃ C
 X . 4a narakāḥ B; narakāḥ C
 X . 6c -śālmali- B; -śālmali- C
 X . 7a dātyūha- B; kādamba- C
 X . 9a -taptopala(śa ?)- B; -taptopalaśa- C
 X . 12a patatu B; patati C
 X . 12c kim idam iti B; kim idam idam iti C
 X . 13b cīri B; cīri C
 X . 16 *om.* C
 X . 19c garbhiṇyaś B; gurviṇyaś C
 X . 21d dhṛtimanto B; dhṛtivanto C
 X . 25b -saṃhatim B; saṃgatim C
 X . 28c nirupāyās tāḥ B; nirupāyāsāḥ C
 X . 40d ḍākinī- B; dākinyo C (*cf.* V . 4d)
 X . 48c -bauddha- B; -buddha- C
 X . 53d mañjunātham B; mañjughoṣam C

C adds an extra verse not found in Tib . or Mong. :

yadā sambhṛtasambhāro maṃjughoṣavyapāśrayāt/
 tadā jñānārthamadyasthas ca neyaṃ(!) kalpasāgarāt //

X. 54c yadācarati B; yathācarati C

Ārya
 例證
 合而

影響
 的漢

也。三
 未廣
 即是一
 響，可
 於佚
 譯本，
 究”，⁵

這部小

大夫降
 品而已
 會熱烈
 則王導
 兄弟王
 或抗迹
 正是這